



Climate Change Advisory Council Meeting –Carbon Budgets Working Group

Meeting 7

Approved MINUTES

Date: 19th October 2023

Start time: 13:30

Venue: EPA officers, Clonskeagh and Video Conference Meeting

Present: In person: Stephen Treacy. On MS Teams: Jeanne Moore, Niall McInerney, Kevin Hanrahan, Emma Lynch, Mert Yakut, Hannah Daly, Brian Ó Gallachóir, Kian Mintz-Woo, Trevor Donnellan, Colm Duffy

Apologies: Yvonne Buckley, David Styles, Oliver Gedden

Observers: In person: John Fitzgerald. Online: Jillian Mahon

Secretariat: In person: George Hussey, Meabh Gallagher, Kieran Craven; Phillip O'Brien, Gina Kelly, Ciara Hilliard. Online: Claire Camilleri

External Presenters: In person: Sadhbh O'Neill (Independent Researcher)

1. Opening of meeting

1.1. Adoption of Agenda

The agenda was adopted by the Carbon Budgets Working Group (CBWG).

1.2. Minutes for the Carbon Budgets Working Group Meeting

The minutes from the previous meeting were accepted by the CBWG.

1.3 Actions

Action 3 of the Actions Log was proposed for closure by the Secretariat, to be opened again as required. There was no opposition for this, and the action was closed.

2. 2024 EPA Projections Process

Presentations were given by the ESRI SEAI and EPA related to the greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions projections process due for completion and publication in 2024.

Mert Yakut from the ESRI presented on the role of the I3E model in the National Energy Modelling Framework and ESRI inputs to the currently ongoing EPA projections process. The model provides macroeconomic, sector specific and household level energy demand outcomes as part of SEAI's NEMF. The model inputs were outlined, including base year, energy demand, energy prices and carbon prices. Key model assumptions were identified. The five scenarios modelled for the ongoing projections process were outlined.

Discussions were held around the model's ability to capture historical policy changes, assumptions for new technologies, and updates to future versions of the model. The implications of future energy demand composition to model outputs were raised. Clarifications on the applications of the different models were made, including possibilities for feedback processes between models.

Emma Lynch presented on SEAI inputs to the ongoing emissions projection process. Key inputs (including I3E outputs) and assumptions (macroeconomic, policy, calibration and modelling input) to the model were outlined. Scenario modelling and output validation were covered along with reporting and assessment of model results. Model results include sector specific outputs and assessment against domestic and EU energy and emissions obligations

EU regulatory requirements, and their comparison to EPA scenarios were discussed. The level of incorporation of external model outputs and assumptions around policy inputs to the projection process were raised. The ability of the model to incorporate behaviour and behaviour change related to policy targets, and the utility of peer-reviewed research to provide data on these were discussed.

Stephen Tracey presented an overview of the EPA 2024 projections process. This included contributing models and inputs, core assumptions underlying projections, sensitivity analysis, model accessibility, and projections methodology. The 2024 emission projection timeline, planned future activity, and key outputs were outlined.

Discussions that followed the presentation included the utility to government departments of outputs from the projection input models, the modelling and projection of international aviation and maritime emissions, and given the increased capacity building of energy modelling teams, the national co-ordination of these teams

It was noted the three presentations would be shared with the CBWG following the meeting.

3. International Approaches to Carbon Budgeting

Sadhbh O'Neill presented on her study of Carbon Budgeting in the UK, New Zealand, the Netherlands, France, Finland and Denmark conducted as an independent researcher for the

Council. She presented on the approaches to setting targets and trajectories where relevant, with potential lessons in an Irish context. The report will be shared with the CBWG once it has been accepted by the Council.

The role of carbon budgets in attaining the goal of net-zero GHG emissions and equity principles were outlined. The main design elements of carbon budgets were presented, including the importance of the policy planning cycle. The data gathering and assessment methodology, and accountability measures for missing carbon budgets was highlighted. Summary comparative results of the jurisdictions were presented along with potential lessons learned. The role of carbon budgets as one part of a comprehensive policy package to reduce emissions was highlighted.

Discussions included the relevant responsible bodies and methodologies for drafting of carbon budgets in jurisdictions that have them, the separate methane target for New Zealand, alignment with global carbon budget, and credibility around not-achieving carbon budgets. The generation of conclusions to the comparative study were discussed. The implications of territorial vs consumption GHG emissions and the role public participation could have in the setting of carbon budgets were raised.

4. Carbon Budgets Work Plan

The Secretariat outlined the work programme for the CBWG including future thematic topics. In November the role of negative emissions, biodiversity considerations, and Agriculture and Land Use Review will be discussed, while the December meeting will include discussion of the first iteration of core modelling results and thematic topics to be confirmed at the next meeting that could include the COP28 Global Stocktake. The ESAB 2040 targets will be moved to 2024.

For the November meeting, the role of negative emissions, with an overview of carbon dioxide removal will be discussed. There will be reflections on the outcome of the September workshop in terms of biodiversity considerations. There will also be a thematic paper presented by the Secretariat for discussion on various aspects of Agriculture and Land Use.

A proposal for the nine 2024 meetings was presented. Meeting invites will be sent out shortly. These will include thematic topics and discussions of the outputs of the scenario modelling and warming impacts. Thematic topics arranged include IEA Net Zero Roadmap, quantitative approaches to carbon budgeting, and energy and power system modelling.

Other topics for consideration in 2024 were proposed by the Secretariat

- Just Transition principles
- Aviation and Maritime aspects
- GHG – air pollution interactions and synergies
- Follow on biodiversity considerations
- Economic assessment of climate and adaptation options
- EU2040 climate targets and GHG budget
- Follow on discussion on methane

Feedback on additional topics and the timings of these topics would be welcome. It was raised the GHG and air pollution theme could follow publication of EPA inventories. Having a

representative of New Zealand Climate Change Commission to talk was proposed, possibly as a Horizon Scanning event.

The remaining timelines of the Carbon Budgets Workplan were outlined.

Action: Members of the CBWG were asked to provide feedback and/or suggestions on the proposed topics for consideration in 2024 as outlined in the presentation

5. Next Steps and Agenda for next meeting

A note outlining the data requirements for an analysis of the impact of mitigation actions on employment and the wider economy will be circulated for review and feedback.

A template outline the inputs for the simple climate models and warming impact analysis will be circulated for review and feedback.

The role of methane in temperature stabilisation was raised. The proposed use of simple climate models looking at temperature stabilisation. The potential for an international review of the process was raised.

The draft agenda for November was outlined.

Action: Secretariat will share a note on the inputs required for macroeconomic analysis and a template regarding the temperature impact analysis with the core modelling teams for review and feedback.

6. AOB

The Secretariat raised that due to buildings works, there will be a change in venue for future meetings. CBWG meetings will now be held in McCumiskey House, Richview, Clonskeagh, with details to follow in an email.

McCumiskey House will be unavailable for the meeting on Thursday 23rd November. An alternative venue for this day was proposed, which will be circulated to the CBWG when confirmed.

The upcoming horizon event on tipping points on 20th November in collaboration with the OECD, Met Eireann and Maynooth University was highlighted. Invitations to this event have previously been shared with the CBWG.

Presenters and participants were thanked for their contributions.

7. CB WG Actions Log

Action Number	Date Raised	Description	Owner	Due	Status
3	20/04/23	Expand discussion of macroeconomic inputs/ drivers	CCAC Secretariat and relevant CB WG Members	Q3 2023	Closed

5	20/04/23	Further develop the approach and preparation for topical discussions	CCAC Secretariat	Q3 2023	Closed
6	27/07/23	CB WG Members to provide comment on the Draft agenda for the September workshop by the 4 th of August	CB WG Members	04/08/23	Closed
7	27/07/23	CCAC Secretariat to schedule individual meetings with modellers prior to finalising the September workshop agenda	CCAC Secretariat	06/09/23	Closed
8	08/09/23	CBWG members to provide feedback on the proposed meeting schedule for 2024	CCAC Secretariat	29/09/23	Closed
9	19/10/23	CBWG members to provide feedback and/or suggestions on the proposed topics for consideration in 2024 as outlined in the Meeting No. 7 presentation	CB WG Members	Nov 2023	Open
10	19/10/23	Secretariat to share a note on the inputs required for macroeconomic analysis and a template regarding the temperature	CCAC Secretariat/ CB WG Members	Nov 2023	Open

		impact analysis with the core modelling teams for review and feedback			
--	--	--	--	--	--